



## AGENDA

### SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING

### CITY OF BANNING, CALIFORNIA

March 14, 2023

4:00 p.m.

**In Chambers and via Zoom**

Council Chambers  
99 E. Ramsey Street  
Banning, CA 92220

*The following information comprises the agenda for the regular meeting of the Banning City Council, a joint meeting of the City Council and Banning Utility Authority, and the Banning City Council sitting in its capacity as the Banning Successor Agency Board.*

***This meeting is being held via Zoom so that members of the public may observe and participate in this meeting electronically. If you participate in this meeting via Zoom, you are agreeing to abide by the City's Zoom Community Standards for Public Meetings (provided in full on the last page of the agenda). Esta reunión se lleva a cabo en la Cámara y a través de Video/Teleconferencia en Zoom para que los miembros del público puedan observar y participar en esta reunión de manera electrónica. Si elige participar en esta reunión a través de Zoom, acepta cumplir con los Estándares comunitarios de Zoom para reuniones públicas de la ciudad (que se proporcionan en su totalidad en la última página de la agenda).***

To observe and participate in the online video portion of the meeting through your personal computer or device, follow this link:

<https://us02web.zoom.us/j/81007280759?pwd=d0JCK0oyeGhOQk5Cek1kd3FJUmlsQT09>

**Meeting ID: 810 0728 0759**

**Password: 092220**

Dial in: +1 669 900 9128 • Meeting ID: 810 0728 0759

#### 1. CALL TO ORDER

Roll Call

#### 2. PUBLIC COMMENT – Agenda Items Only

#### 3. WORKSHOP

- 3.1. Zero-Emission Bus (ZEB) Rollout and Implementation Plan Technology Selection..... **4**

**Recommendation:** Staff recommends that the City Council consider all information provided during the Innovative Clean Transit (ICT) and Zero-Emission Bus (ZEB) Rollout and Implementation Plan workshop.

#### 4. ADJOURNMENT

### **Zoom Community Standards for Public Meetings**

*By participating in this meeting on Zoom, you are agreeing to abide by the City of Banning's Community Standards for Public Meetings. Zoom attendees that fail to adhere to these standards may be removed from the meeting room.*

- Your microphone must remain on mute, and you may only unmute your microphone when/if you are recognized by the Mayor.
- Your camera must be turned off unless/until you are recognized by the Mayor.
- To indicate a desire to make Public Comment, you must use the Raise Hand function. The Mayor will not recognize those who have not used the Raise Hand function.
- Public Comment from Zoom attendees will immediately follow in person comment from members of the public in Council Chambers.
- If you fail to adhere to these community guidelines, **you may be removed** for disrupting the meeting occurring in Council Chambers. You may rejoin the meeting but may be removed for each violation of these community standards.
- The chat function will be disabled for all City Council meetings on Zoom.

### **Estándares comunitarios de Zoom para Reuniones Públicas**

*Al participar en esta reunión en Zoom, usted acepta cumplir con los Estándares Comunitarios para Reuniones Públicas de la ciudad de Banning. Los que atienden por Zoom que no cumplan con estos estándares pueden ser retirados de la sala de reuniones.*

- Su micrófono debe permanecer en silencio, y solo puede reactivar su micrófono cuando / si es reconocido por el alcalde.
- Su cámara debe estar apagada a menos que sea reconocido por el alcalde.
- Para indicar el deseo de hacer un Comentario Público, debe utilizar la función Levantar la mano. El alcalde no reconocerá a quienes no hayan utilizado la función Levantar la mano.
- Los comentarios públicos de lo que atienden por Zoom seguirán inmediatamente los comentarios en persona de los miembros del público en las Cámaras del Consejo.
- Si no cumple con estas pautas de la comunidad, es posible que lo destituyan por interrumpir la reunión que tiene lugar en las Cámaras del Consejo. Puede volver a unirse a la reunión, pero es posible que lo eliminen por cada violación de estos estándares de la comunidad.
- La función de chat estará deshabilitada para todas las Reuniones del Ayuntamiento en Zoom.

## **AFFIDAVIT • DECLARACIÓN JURADA**

IT IS HEREBY CERTIFIED under the laws of the State of California that the above agenda was posted on the City's website ([www.banningca.gov](http://www.banningca.gov)) as well as the Bulletin Board at Banning City Hall, located at 99 E Ramsey Street, Banning, CA 92220 by 4:00 P.M. on the 9th day of March 2023.



Caroline Patton, Deputy City Clerk  
Secretario adjunto de la ciudad

## **PUBLIC NOTICE • NOTICIA PÚBLICA**

### **Meeting Agendas and Notices**

Interested in receiving email and/or text notifications of upcoming City Council meetings? Sign up for meeting notifications through Notify Me (<https://banningca.gov/list.aspx>). Pursuant to amended Government Code §54957.5(b), staff reports and other public records related to open session agenda items are available on the City's website ([www.banningca.gov/archive](http://www.banningca.gov/archive)).

### **Public Comment**

#### *Agenda Items*

Any member of the public may address this meeting of the City Council on any item appearing on the agenda. A five-minute limitation shall apply to each member of the public and no member of the public shall be permitted to share their time with any other person. *Special meetings do not have public comment periods for non-agenda items.*

### **Special Assistance/Accessibility Requests**

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, any member of the public may request that the agenda and agenda packet be mailed to them. If you need special assistance to participate in this meeting (such as translation services), please contact the Office of the City Clerk. Advanced notification of at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will allow the city to make arrangements to ensure your accessibility.

**¿Necesita servicios de traducción para participar?** Contacto Oficina del Secretario de la Ciudad.

## **CONTACT • CONTACTO**

Office of the City Clerk • 951-922-3102 • [CityClerks@banningca.gov](mailto:CityClerks@banningca.gov)  
99 East Ramsey Street, Banning, California 92220



## **CITY OF BANNING STAFF REPORT**

**TO:** CITY COUNCIL

**FROM:** Douglas Schulze, City Manager

**PREPARED BY:** Art Vela, Director of Public Works  
Stephanie Sirls, Transit Manager

**MEETING DATE:** March 14, 2023

**SUBJECT:** Zero-Emission Bus (ZEB) Rollout and Implementation Plan  
Technology Selection

---

### **RECOMMENDATION:**

Staff recommends that the City Council consider all information provided during the Innovative Clean Transit (ICT) and Zero-Emission Bus (ZEB) Roll-out and Implementation Plan workshop.

### **BACKGROUND:**

Staff presented information on CARB's Innovative Clean Transit (ICT) regulation and Zero-Emission Bus (ZEB) Rollout and Implementation Plan to Council on February 28<sup>th</sup>, 2023. Staff also advised that to meet the ICT submission deadline a workshop and subsequent recommendation for Council selection of zero-emission bus technology would be scheduled for March 14, 2023.

Under CARB's ICT regulations, the approved zero-emission fuel technology solutions include battery electric and hydrogen fuel cell. The plan must include several analyzed components to reach the goal of a complete fleet transition to zero-emission buses by 2040. Key components analyzed in the development and preparation of the City of Banning's ZEB Rollout and Implementation Plan include:

- Review of the existing conditions.
  - Relevant demographics
  - Service area characteristics
  - Existing fleet sizes and conditions
- Preparation of reports based on the findings and conclusions and preferred zero-emission technology option(s).
- Development of a detailed capital and operating financial analysis comparing the purchase of ZEB's to the purchase of existing CNG buses and a long-term implementation strategy report

Capital Analysis components include:

- Purchasing & procurement schedule with efforts to avoid early retirement of conventional CNG buses.
- A schedule and location for ZEB facilities and infrastructure.
- Training plan and schedule for ZEB operators, maintenance, and repair staff.

Financial Analysis components include:

- Fleet costs
- Fuel costs
- Maintenance costs
- Preliminary infrastructure projects & costs
- Total cost of Ownership
- Benefits and drawback of each technology, i.e., battery elect and hydrogen cell fuel.

#### Banning's Existing Conditions and Financial Report Summary

Due to the mandate criteria, this analysis was required to study the City's conditions under existing service routes. Below is a summary of findings based on the analysis specific to Banning's existing transit services and conditions, i.e., existing routes, relevant demographics, service area characteristics, existing fleet sizes and conditions, location and status of charging and maintenance infrastructure and financial impacts of each.

#### Battery Electric Buses (BEBs)

- Fueling time longer than CNG bus
- Overnight depot charging and opportunity on-route charging would be required
- Fuel costs highly variable, but could prove to be preferred, based on internal partnerships with Banning Electric Utility
- BEB Fuel Costs are approximately 50% lower than a mixed fleet or hydrogen fuel-cell only
- Annual maintenance costs are roughly \$500,000 less than hydrogen fuel-cell
- BEB infrastructure costs are lower than the other options by a minimum of \$3.4M
- No additional land needed for infrastructure (per staff assessment)

#### Fuel Cell Electric Buses (FCEB) (aka hydrogen fuel)

- Comparable range to CNG bus – 1:1 replacement ratio
- Fueling time comparable to CNG bus
- Fuel cost significantly higher than fossil fuel and BEB
- Bus cost higher than BEB
- High infrastructure costs but may reduce per bus when scaled up
- Greater resilience
- Land acquisition unknown (not analyzed by CTE as part of this report)

While the City must select a transit technology selection for inclusion into its final ZEB Roll-out Plan for submission to CARB before July 1, 2023, the City is not required to make it's first ZEB purchase until 2028 per the ICT procurement schedule. Additionally, the

technology recommendation for inclusion into the City's ZEB Roll-out Plan is specific to transit and is separate from CARB's Advanced Clean Fleets regulation that requires 50% of medium and heavy-duty city vehicle purchases to be zero-emission beginning 2024 and 100 percent of medium and heavy-duty city fleet vehicles to be zero-emission by 2027.

A full copy of the existing condition analysis and financial analysis reports is attached to this staff report.

**FISCAL IMPACT:**

There is no fiscal impact related to this staff report. Costs for implementing the City's ZEB Rollout and Implementation Plan will be presented at future meetings.

**ATTACHMENT:**

1. City of Banning Existing Conditions Report  
[https://banningca.gov/DocumentCenter/View/12411/Att-1-City-of-Banning\\_Existing-Conditions-Report-Final](https://banningca.gov/DocumentCenter/View/12411/Att-1-City-of-Banning_Existing-Conditions-Report-Final)

Approved by:



Douglas Schulze  
City Manager